To Keep or Cull? The Economics of Recycling Cows

Joe Patton

Teagasc Liquid Milk Specialist



Background

- Recycling (carryover) cows an accepted part of the system
 - Mean calving interval 436 days
- Reduces direct cost of empty culling rate
- Late calving spring cows contribute winter litres
- Saleable heifers- keep mature cows
- Reduced focus on criteria for compact calving?
 - Submission rate
 - 6 week in calf rate
 - Genetics for fertility



A high culling rate does not come cheap...

	Replacement/Cull Value Differential						
Additional Empty Culling Rate	€400	€600	€800				
4%	€1,600	€2,400	€3,200				
6%	€2,400	€3,600	€4,800				
8%	€3,200	€4,800	€6,400				
10%	€4,000	€6,000	€8,000				

Table 1. Direct cost of additional culling rate for a 100-cow he	ərd
---	-----

Table 2. Culling rate and milk revenue loss due to reduced herd maturity for a 100-cow herd

	Herd base milk production level (litres)						
Additional Empty Culling Rate	6000	7000	8000				
4%	€1,293	€1,510	€1,701				
6%	€1,939	€2,266	€2,552				
8%	€2,585	€3,021	€3,403				
10%	€3,231	€3,776	€4,253				



Background

- Significant direct culling cost at high empty rate
- Recycling cows mitigates this cost may have indirect effects on
 - Milk volume sales
 - Feed cost
 - Youngstock numbers and management
- Calving Interval is the driver of these effects
- Can be quantified



Calving Interval- Effects on Milk Yield





Calving Interval- Effect on Milk Yield

- Milk yield performance can be quoted as
 - 305-day milk recorded yield
 - Lactation total
 - Annual
- Increasing from a 365-day calving interval results in
 - Higher lactation yield
 - Lower annual yield



Calving Interval and annual milk yield

	Μ Α	nimal	Deta	ails	a la	*P	7	Details	& EBI	Indexe	s		6
Jumb	00					Sire							
Тад						Dam							
	e 08-No	-04	7v 3n	•		Dam's	Sire						
Bree	HO 93	.8% I	FR 3.19	%		FBI	Milk	Fert	Calv	Beef	Mair	nten	Health
							mint		Carr		man		noun
EBI F	Rank 1					€189	€70	€97	€25	- €12	€8		€2
In He	rd Born Ir	n herd				Milk K	g Fat Kg	Prot Kg	Fat %	Prot %	Calv	. Int.	Survival
Statu	IS Milking) T 10 UV	7			194	18.5	11	0.2	0.08	-5.7	′ davs	2.4%
Due	carve 21-00	1-12 H I	Z		ЕхрЕВГ€∠Т		10.0			0.00	•		
Price					As.								
R		/ing &	Fert	ility	-	J.		Ν	lilk Pro	oductic	on		
6 D		/ing & _{Calf}	Fert	ility ^{On}	Mum Calv	/ Milk	Fat	N Prot	<mark>lilk Pro</mark> Fat	oductio Prot	on F+P		
Lact	Calved	/ing & Calf Tag	Fert _{Sex}	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	/ Milk kg	Fat kg	N Prot kg	filk Pro	oductic Prot %	DN F+P kg	SCC	Days
Lact	Calved	/ing & Calf Tag 70939	Fert Sex	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	/ Milk kg	Fat kg	Prot kg	Fat %	oductic Prot %	on F+P kg	SCC 952	Days 274
Lact	Calved 03-Oct-07 01-Sep-08	/ing & Calf Tag 70939 60987	Fert Sex	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	Milk kg	Fat kg	Prot kg	fat %	oductic Prot %	5 35 731	SCC 952 39	Days 274 333
Lact 1 2 3	Calved 03-Oct-07 01-Sep-08 23-Sep-09	/ing & Calf Tag 70939 60987 51092	Fert Sex	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	Milk kg 7786	Fat kg	N Prot kg 236	A FT	oductic Prot %	Ph F+P kg 535 731 671	SCC 952 39 73	Days 274 333 297
Lact 1 2 3 4	Calved 03-Oct-07 01-Sep-08 23-Sep-09 11-Sep-10	/ing & Calf Tag 70939 60987 51092 11171	Fert Sex	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	Milk kg 7786	Fat kg 200 kg: 98	N Prot kg 236 9% of qu	Fat %	oductic Prot %	Ph F+P kg 535 731 671 775	SCC 952 39 73 55	Days 274 333 297 354
Lact 1 2 3 4 5	Calved 03-Oct-07 01-Sep-08 23-Sep-09 11-Sep-10 05-Nov-11	/ing & Calf Tag 70939 60987 51092 11171 61291	Fert Sex	ility On Farm	Num Calv Serve Int	Milk kg 7786	Fat kg 200 kg: 98	N Prot kg 236 % of qu	A E7 Uoted	oductic Prot % 7 56 57 3. 9	Ph F+P kg 535 731 671 775 156	SCC 952 39 73 55 28	Days 274 333 297 354 68
Lact 1 2 3 4 5	Calved 03-Oct-07 01-Sep-08 23-Sep-09 11-Sep-10 05-Nov-11	/ing & Calf Tag 70939 60987 51092 11171 61291	Fert Sex	ility On Farm N Annu Avg (1	Num Calv Serve Int 1 al Yield 2 420 Comp) 374	Milk kg 7786	Fat kg 200 kg: 98 92 387	N Prot kg 236 5% of qu 05 291	A 57 4 57	oductic Prot % 7 56 57 3.19 3.64	Ph F+P kg 535 731 671 775 156 678	952 39 73 55 28 280	Days 274 333 297 354 68 315



Calving Interval and annual milk yield

12	×	Anim	al Deta	ails		*P	7	Details	& EBI	Indexe	S	6
Jumb	00					Sire						
lag						Dam						
DOB	- 20-	-Sep-05	6v 5m	ı		Dam's	Sire LG	С				
Breed	HC	93.8%	FR 3.19	6		EBI	Milk	Fert	Calv	Beef	Mainten	Health
EBI R	ank 17	0				-€5	€44	-€ 33	€3	-€7	-€7	-€5
In He	rd Bo	rn In herd				Milk K	g Fat Kg	Prot Kg	Fat %	Prot %	Calv. Int.	Survival
Statu Due (s Mil Calve 12-	king •SEP-12 II	RP	E	ExpEBI € 100	377	3	12	-0.19	-0.01	2.9 days	0.1%
A 65	C	alving	& Fert	ility	-	IJ		Ν	/ilk Pr	oductio	on	
		Calf		On	Num Calv	Milk	Fat	Prot	Fat	Prot	F+P	
Lact	Calveo	d Tag	Sex	Farm	Serve Int	kg	kg	kg	%	%	kg SCC	C Days
1	04-Sep-	07 4162	20							19	531 78	330
2	24-Oct-0	08 6186	51 A	nnua	l Yield 6	877 k	(a: 71)	% of a	loted	21	614 42	343
3	20-Nov-	09 9204	5				.9			47	896 278	448
4	13-May-	11 9234	2 -	Y	2 539	6445	213	209	3.31	3.25	423 184	257
				Avg (C	omp) 449	9689	352	328	3.64	3.39	680 133	374
				Lifetime	e Production	35513	1269	1194	3.57	3.36	2464	1378



Calving interval affects annual yield per cow



Figure 1. Association between calving interval and ratio of annual to lactation milk yield per cow in liquid milk herds



Effect of Herd Calving Interval on Milk Yield

- Herd average calving interval
 - A composite of widely ranging values within herd
 - Worst 10-15% of herd may have a disproportionate effect
- Impact of changes
 - Milk yield potential
 - Lactation persistency
 - Dry-off policy (yield and date)
- Herd-specific
- Possible to model these effects (lactation curves)



Structure of Herd Average Calving Interval

	Herd Average Calving Interval								
Category	375	401	422	443	464	485			
365	47	25	14	8	8	2			
380	34	32	22	14	3	3			
400	11	11	18	18	11	4			
430	5	14	14	14	14	11			
450	3	6	6	9	13	13			
470	0	8	8	3	8	9			
490	0	4	14	17	17	21			
530	0	0	4	16	16	19			
550	0	0	0	1	10	18			
Total Cows	100	100	100	100	100	100			



Effect of Herd Calving Interval on Annual Milk Yield



Figure 2. Change in annual milk yield per cow across a range in herd calving intervals, relative to a 375-day herd average



Effect of calving interval on milk revenue losses for 100 cow herd

Herd Calving Interval	6000	7000	8000			
401	€9,660 ³	€7,320	€4,380			
422	€16,770	€13,620	€9,060			
443	€23,760	€20,700	€14,970			
464	€30,570	€28,020	€20,490			
485	€37,290	€35,370	€26,520			

Herd Base² Production Level (litres)

¹Relative to a 375 day calving interval

² Based on 305-d yield for a herd with 370 day calving interval

³ Based on a 30cpl annualised milk price



Calving Interval- Effect on Feed Cost



Calving Interval- Effect on Feed Cost

- Annual feed budget cost is determined by
 - Herd milk yield potential
 - Stocking rate and forage utilised
 - Calving Pattern
- Optimized calving pattern reduces proportion of high cost milk
- Recycling cows and long calving intervals results in slippage from optimal
 - Very difficult to maintain control at >430 days herd Cl
- Modelled annual feed cost of structured and unstructured calving patterns



Calving Pattern- Effect on Feed Budget Cost

Table 5. Estimated total feed budget cost of optimum versus unstructured calving pa					

	Herd Average Base Milk Yield							
Calving Pattern	6000	7000	8000					
Optimum ¹	€46,715	€60,643	€74,928					
Unstructured ²	€53,024	€67,761	€82,533					
Difference	€6,309	€7,118	€7,605					

¹ Optimum pattern of 65% calving Feb-Apr and 35% calving in Oct-Dec

² Unstructured pattern extends season to include 15% calving Apr-Jun and 16% August-September







Calving Interval- Effect on Replacement Numbers

- Common assumption that recycling reduces heifer requirements
 - Reduces empty culling rate in the short term
 - No evidence of a drop in overall culling rate
- Replacement heifers reared per cow an important efficiency factor
- Recycling cows reduces calves born per cow per year
 - Negative impact on youngstock numbers and value
 - Increased risk of out-of-season calving



Calving Interval- Effect on Heifer Numbers

Herd Calving Interval	Calves born per Cow per Yr	Breeding Heifers	Beef calves	Revenue Diff
375	0.97	39	54	-
401	0.91	36	50	€1,411
422	0.86	35	48	€2,424
443	0.82	33	45	€3,341
464	0.79	31	43	€4,175
485	0.75	30	41	€4,937

Per 100 cows Assuming 5% mortality, €450 heifer calf value and €80 beef calf value







Time to get serious...

- 1. Record and use your data
- 2. Work to seasonal fertility targets
 - Submit 90% of all cows eligible for breeding in the first 21 days
 - 100% of recycled cows submitted for service during week 1
- 3. Heat detection: Attention to detail in the early weeks
- 4. Bull power to compact late calvers in the summer breeding season
 - One bull per 15 to 20 non-pregnant cows at the end of AI
 - Eliminate May June and August calving
- 5. Herd sires must have EBI fertility sub-index of €120 or higher
 - This applies to stock bulls
- 6. Cull 10% cows with the worst calving interval each year
- 7. Block calve heifers at the start of each season (>80% in 6 weeks)
- 8. Manage BCS (extra days dry, high energy/low protein diets, once daily milking)



In summary

- Huge hidden cost of poor fertility in many split calving herds
 - Need to be able to show this on a herd-specific basis
- Recycling cows = Short term gain for long-term pain
- Increasing culling rate alone will not work:
 - Need to tackle the underlying reasons for the need to recycle
- An holistic herd management approach is needed
- This will take years!









